



March 16, 2017-Marriott Downtown Centre, Toronto

INDIGENOUS PROGRAM PATHWAYS INVENTORY
PROJECT: PHASE ONE RESULTS
Roundtable Discussion

Meeting Agenda and Objectives



Time	Item	Objective(s)
9:00a.m.- 9:20a.m.	Introductions	
9:20a.m.- 10:00a.m.	Presentation of Phase One Results	-To present methodology, findings & recommendations from Phase One
10:15a.m.- 11:00 a.m.	Final Report Activity & Discussion	-To identify key findings, areas that require expansion & gaps -To ensure continuity between report content & recommendations
11:00a.m.- 12:15 p.m.	Recommendations Activity & Discussion	-To further prioritize recommendations -To identify ideas and actionable items that support recommendation implementation
12:15p.m.- 1:00 p.m.	Lunch	
1:00p.m.- 2:15p.m.	Wrap-Up & Forum Discussion	-To complete any outstanding work from the morning -To discuss forum objectives and structure -To identify potential participants & experts for the forum

Introductions



- What is your Name, Title and the Institution that you represent?
- Name one innovative/successful activity/program/practice in Indigenous education from your institution
- What is one activity/program/practice in Indigenous education that you aspire to implement?





Methodology

Methodology



- Environmental scan of pathway survey instruments conducted
- 42 question survey (multiple choice and open-ended questions) developed and tested internally
- Introductory letter and subsequent survey sent to admission/pathway/Indigenous leads at Aboriginal institutes, colleges and universities in the province
- Survey open September-October 2016
- Multiple responses from an institution were collated for analysis
- Participants who indicated a willingness to participate in follow-up discussions were contacted via email

Methodology Cont.



- Forty-six participants, representing 30 institutions (1 survey discarded)
- 1-3 responses per participating institution
- Institution response rate was 55% (colleges 75%; universities 41%; Aboriginal institutes 33%)
- Sixty percent of respondents from colleges (30% universities; 10% Aboriginal institutes)
- Twenty-nine percent of respondents were Indigenous leads, 24% pathway leads and 16% were admission leads. Thirty-one percent of respondents occupied other positions at their respective institution
- Response rates varied by question

Methodology Cont.



NUMBER OF RESPONSES BY INSTITUTION PER SURVEY QUESTION

Q1: N=30	Q8: N=23	Q15: N=14	Q22: N=4	Q29: N=1	Q36: N=18
Q2: N=30	Q9: N=29	Q16: N=10	Q23: N=14	Q30: N=3	Q37: N=22
Q3: N=30	Q10: N=19	Q17: N=14	Q24: N=1	Q31: N=1	Q38: N=19
Q4: N=20	Q11: N=19	Q18: N=7	Q25: N=2	Q32: N=4	Q39: N=24
Q5: N=19	Q12: N=14	Q19: N=13	Q26: N=2	Q33: N=4	Q40: N=23
Q6: N=14	Q13: N=13	Q20: N=14	Q27: N=3	Q34: N=25	Q41: N=23
Q7: N=14	Q14: N=15	Q21: N=4	Q28: N=1	Q35: N=19	Q42: N=19

Methodology Cont.



- Twenty-two individuals from 19 institutions (14 colleges and 5 universities) willing to participate in a follow-up conversation
- 12 institutions (8 colleges, 4 universities) participated in follow-up conversations occurring in December 2016-January 2017
- 16 individuals participated in the follow-up conversations
- Follow-up conversations were approximately 0.5 to 1.5 hours in length



Results

Definitions



- A pathway is defined as a route from one program to another program that contains specified eligibility requirements and awarded transfer credits and/or other benefits to be applied at the receiving institution (adapted from ONTransfer, online).
- An Indigenous program is defined as any program which is rooted in or directed toward Indigenous peoples' knowledges, practices and experiences.

Results-Indigenous Programs



- Sixty seven percent (n=20) of participating institutions indicated that they have Indigenous programs in place
- In the 2015/16 academic year, on average, 165 learners were enrolled in Indigenous programs at a post-secondary institution in Ontario
- The most widespread areas of study are social services, preparatory studies, and health
- Science, environmental, and art and design were among the least widespread disciplines of study
- Award granted ranged from BOG certificate to doctorate, with certificate, diplomas, and Bachelor degrees among the most popular
- There are many innovative programs in Ontario that are among the first of their kind in Canada or North America
- Majority of programs delivered in-person

Results-Indigenous Pathways



- 67% of Aboriginal institutes, 61% of colleges and 87.5% of universities indicated the presence of an Indigenous pathway
- 20-60% of learners in programs subject to pathway from pathway
- Pathways most prevalent in the social science disciplines
- Fluidity between programs (e.g. social services, Indigenous studies, and community development) & multiple pathways per program
- No reported pathways in justice, hospitality and tourism, and aviation or graduate level pathways
- Lack of pathways identified in justice, environmental studies and art & design
- Diploma most common credential to gain access and BA Hons. most pursued credential

NUMBER OF ABORIGINAL INSTITUTES, COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES WITH INDIGENOUS PROGRAMS (PGM) AND PATHWAYS (PWY) BY DISCIPLINE



<i>Discipline</i>	# of Aboriginal Institutes		# of Colleges		# of Universities		Total	
	PGM	PWY	PGM	PWY	PGM	PWY	PGM	PWY
<i>Art & Design</i>	•	•	•	•	1	1	1	1
<i>Aviation</i>	1	-	1	-	-	-	2	-
<i>Business & Administration</i>	2	1	1	1	-	1	3	3
<i>Community Development</i>	-	-	4	3	-	-	4	3
<i>Education</i>	1	1	2	3	2	1	5	5
<i>Environmental</i>	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	1
<i>Health</i>	3	2	3	2	1	-	7	4
<i>Hospitality & Tourism</i>	1	-	1	-	-	-	2	-
<i>Indigenous Studies</i>	•	•	2	2	4	1	6	3
<i>Justice</i>	1	-	1	-	1	-	3	-
<i>Language</i>	•	•	3	1	2	1	5	2
<i>Preparatory Studies</i>	1	-	5	2	1	1	7	3
<i>Science</i>	•	•	•	•	•	1	•	1
<i>Social Services</i>	3	1	4	7	1	1	8	9
<i>Trades & Technology</i>	1	1	1	-	-	-	2	1

NUMBER OF ABORIGINAL INSTITUTES, COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES WITH INDIGENOUS PATHWAYS BY EARNED & PURSUANT CREDENTIAL



of Aboriginal Institutes

of Colleges

of Universities

<i>Credential Type</i>	# of Aboriginal Institutes		# of Colleges		# of Universities	
	Earned	Pursuant	Earned	Pursuant	Earned	Pursuant
<i>Certificate</i>	2	-	2	-	2	-
<i>Diploma</i>	1	1	10	2	4	-
<i>Advanced Diploma / Degree</i>	1	1	-	1	-	-
<i>Bachelors</i>	-	-	-	1	-	1
<i>Honours Bachelors</i>	-	2	-	10	-	5
<i>Other</i>	-	-	-	-	1	-

Results-Indigenous Pathways Cont.



- One pathway program reported a waitlist, and others had high interest levels
- Identified need for pathways that are relevant to Indigenous peoples
- Indigenous program pathways are not synonymous with pathways for Indigenous learners
- Continued need for fluidity among pathways
- Indigenous learners may only enter or return to post-secondary studies years after high school or a preparatory program
- ¼ of institutions reported bridging or transition programs in place

Results-Pathway Learners



- Only five institutions indicated that they track demographic information
- One institution shared that 87% of Indigenous pathway learners are female; Three institutions provided geographic information with learners remaining close to home
- Distribution of Indigenous learners in Indigenous pathway programs is comparable to Indigenous programs overall
- Pathways commonly accessed by non-Indigenous learners and urban Indigenous learners

% of Pathway Learners with Aboriginal Ancestry

% of learners in Indigenous programs with Aboriginal Ancestry	Less than 5%	5-25%	25-50%	50-75%	More than 75%	Unknown
Less than 5%	50%	0%	0%	0%	0%	50%
5-25%	0%	0%	0%	0%	50%	50%
25-50%	0%	0%	50%	0%	0%	50%
50-75%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
More than 75%	0%	0%	0%	0%	87.5%	62.5%
Unknown	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%

Results-Credit Assessment



- The amount of credits awarded varied from less than one year to two years of study , with the most common being under two years
- Eight institutions believed credit assessment a 50/50 effort between the sending and receiving institution
- Block credit transfer, program/course outcomes, case by case basis, and course outline review methodologies all common, with 2-3 methodologies used concurrently
- No significant relationship between the maximum number of credits awarded in a pathway and level of collaboration, transfer methodology or involvement of various positions in the institution
- Identified need for Indigenous content experts to participate in the transfer credits assessment process

Results- Indigenous Knowledges and Credit Assessment



- Multiple institutions indicated that they have or are currently in the process of indigenizing their curriculum/institution
- When IK was present in non-Indigenous programs, one out of five institutions imparted that IK was factored into credit assessment
- Four institutions have pathways between programs rooted in different cultural traditions, with $\frac{3}{4}$ factoring this difference into assessment
- Interdisciplinary and laddering approaches noted as promising practices. Need to examine integrated approaches in accelerated programs identified
- Tensions between an Indigenous wholistic framework and the credit assessment process and “seeing the learner” acknowledged

Results-Credit Assessment and Personal Experience



- Prior experience was viewed as relevant in multiple disciplines
- Specific methods to assess experience included: challenge exams, curriculum vitae reviews, letters of support and/or essay writing
- Prior Learning and Recognition (PLAR) as a methodology received mixed reviews by participants
- Considerations included assessing language competencies, positioning learners as knowledge holders, and creating new knowledge through deepened understandings
- Work being done to develop pathways with non-accredited institutions

Results- Advantages, Disadvantages & Challenges



- Most respondents agreed pathways provide educational advancement opportunities for the learner (91%), greater access (91%), improved learner mobility (87%), flexibility and convenience (83%) and professional advancement opportunities (74%)
- Pathway development seen as a way to support reconciliation
- 45% of respondents believed there were no disadvantages; Most prominent disadvantage was learners taking courses they may not want to take (35%). Self ID and funding issues also reported
- Challenges include: undervaluing and lack of understanding of IK, lack of resources, restrictive policies, lack of data, K-12 transition, perceived competition & measures of success



Recommendations

Recommendations



Wholistic and Accessible Pathways

- Indigenous pathway development should be comprehensive, spanning from secondary school to employment;
- An enhanced focus on academic upgrading and other initial entry points to post-secondary studies should occur to support access to Indigenous pathways as some Indigenous learners do not currently meet eligibility requirements; and,
- Collaboration among sending and receiving institutions should extend beyond transfer credit assessment to include data sharing and the delivery of wrap-around supports.

Recommendations Cont.



Community Relevancy and Involvement

- Indigenous communities and learners must be meaningfully involved in the pathway development process; An environmental scan of similar pathways should be conducted prior to new pathway development to maximize learner advantages such as credits awarded and provided to communities to support these efforts;
- Indigenous communities, Elders, fluent language speakers and other content specialists should be involved in the credit assessment process; and,
- Indigenous pathways need to provide access to skills and knowledge deemed useful and relevant to communities. This should be demonstrated through laddering curriculum or other means.

Recommendations Cont.



Pathway Expansion

- There is a lack of Indigenous pathways within disciplines that are both meaningful and relevant to Indigenous communities, such as justice, environmental science and art & design. Further pathway development in these areas should be explored; and,
- Indigenous learners are spread across disciplines, requiring the development of additional pathways outside of Indigenous programs.

Enhanced Data

- Sub-populations of Indigenous learners are accessing Indigenous pathways more frequently than others. More granular information is needed on pathway access for Indigenous learners to inform strategies to improve access; and,
- Data can be a powerful tool to identify potential pathways, better understand the Indigenous pathway learner experience(s) and support automatic credit transfer processes. Further planning at an institutional and system level needs to occur to support data collection and analysis efforts.

Recommendations Cont.



Indigenous Approaches to Pathway Development

- Personal experience is a respected knowledge tradition among Indigenous peoples and post-secondary institutions should recognize the personal experiences of Indigenous pathway learners upon entry. Innovative work in both an Indigenous and non-Indigenous context is beginning to occur that can inform practices in Ontario institutions. This work should be reviewed and expanded;
- Institutions across Ontario are using a variety of approaches to incorporate Indigenous knowledges including integration into current curriculum, stand-alone courses and through extra-curricular experiential opportunities. As such a spectrum of approaches to credit assessment of Indigenous content should be explored in place of a standardized approach;
- Ontario is only at the cusp of incorporating Indigenous knowledges in credit assessment, promising practices, including outcome and interdisciplinary approaches should be explored further; and,
- Alternative modes of program delivery and subsequent pathways that align with the lived experience of Indigenous learners, such as collaborative-based programming and block programming should be explored. A more comprehensive review of institutional and system level policies, including funding policies, is needed to identify barriers to alternative models.



Discussion and Activities

Final Report Activity and Discussion: 1, 2, 4, All



We will examine each of the following sets of questions alone, in-pairs, in foursomes and lastly as a group:

- Are there findings that you think garner more weight (have more potential impact) than others? Do these findings receive adequate attention in the report? If not, are there any suggestions?
- Are the recommendations reflective of the report content? Are there additional recommendations that should be gleaned from the content? What recommendations should be prioritized? Are there additional areas of research and/or collaboration that have not been identified but would be beneficial to explore?

Recommendation Implementation Activity & Discussion: 25/10 Crowd Surfing



1. Review the recommendations and select one. Now ask yourself “If you were ten times bolder, what big idea would you recommend? What first step would you take to get started?” Write this on your index card
2. Next, pass the index cards around. When Lana says stop find a partner and discuss the card in your hand then on the back of the index card rate the idea from 1-5.
3. After that we will repeat step 2 four more times.
4. Now we will score the ideas and repeat steps 1-4
5. Lastly, we will discuss the top 10

Rating Scale



Go Big Golf Course Rating Scale	
Score	Description
1	Ace! Hole-In-One! (The BEST)
2	Eagle! (Great Job!)
3	Birdie (Good; Keep it up!)
4	Par (About Average)
5	Bogey or Worse (Keep Trying!)

https://www.google.ca/url?sa=i&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=images&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=0ahUKEwIGwpDF0sLSAhVCzoMKHVdQBmcQJB0IBg&url=http%3A%2F%2Fgobiggolf.com%2Fgbg-course-rating-scale.html&psig=AFQJCNFqqMX0mEhGhJMjtI_1STLrRMOStg&ust=1488915789328530

Forum Planning Discussion



- I would consider the forum to be a huge success if happened
- Who needs to be involved?
- Are there local or regional experts that would add additional value to the forum?
- From your experience in similar forums, is there something that has worked really well for session facilitation, networking, in any other areas?
- Any logistical suggestions (time etc.)?



- Miigwetch for your time and contribution today!
- Please remember to keep all of your receipts and fill out your expense form

